

**YOUNGSTOWN CONGREGATIONAL COLLABORATION IMPLEMENTATION  
COMMITTEE (YCCIC)**

**Meeting Minutes March 16, 2021**

**Call to Order:** Mark Huberman, Elliot Legow and Lee Burdman called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m. via zoom.

**Present Were:**

Mark Huberman  
Elliot Legow  
Lee Burdman  
Jack Kessler  
Sam D. Roth  
Harriet Schor  
Aaron Hively  
Beverly Nathan  
Brigitt Berk  
Richard Shapiro  
Samie Winick  
Andy Lipkin, Ex Officio  
Susan Schwebel Epstein, Ex Officio

**Absent:**

Alvin Weisberg, Ex Officio  
Mark Zeidenstein

**1. Governance/Organizational Structure Sub-Committee Report:** Mark Huberman reported that his Sub-Committee had its third meeting on March 2, 2021. At the meeting, the Committee responded favorably to a proposal by Aaron Hively to increase the size of the new Board from the previously proposed 16 to 24 so that the new entity will have the benefit of continuing the involvement of some of the most active members of each current Temple. Although the size of the Board has increased, the proportionality would remain, and therefore, the initial membership of the new Board would be comprised by 12 members appointed by Rodef Sholom and 6 each by El Emeth and Ohev Tzedek. No objections were raised to this modification to the prior proposal.

The Committee is also recommending that the existing Sisterhoods and Brotherhoods be consolidated and that the Presidents of each be members of the Board but on a non-voting basis unless they are already serving a Board position.

The Committee is in the process of developing a recommendation for the administrative staffing of the new Congregation and has already gathered data on the people who currently staff the Temples and what they are paid. At the next meeting set for March 18, 2021, they will be reviewing job descriptions of those currently serving. One area of particular interest is the role

of Programming which is currently handled differently by each Temple. It was noted that this might become the responsibility of a Cantor/Educator if one were to be hired. In this regard, the Committee also shared their thoughts on the larger issue of Jewish Education but recognized that this is more appropriately a discussion for Elliot's Sub-Committee. Finally, the Committee noted the importance of Temple staffing incorporating institutional memory for the consolidating Temples, at least in the early years.

**2. Ritual, Artifacts and Education Sub-Committee Report:** Elliot Legow reported that his Sub-Committee has formed additional Sub-Committees for Education and Clergy Search.

The core Sub-Committee continues to study the issue of what should be the disposition of the many paintings, plaques, artifacts and archives of the three Temples in a consolidated entity. Elliot noted that there may be some 21<sup>st</sup> Century vehicles for digitally preserving and presenting memorials and more. He noted again that Rodef is currently working with YSU to archive its many records and more Sarah Wilschak will be meeting with Sandy Kessler and Harriet Schor too discuss combined efforts.

Mark Huberman suggested exploring New Castle's experience utilizing the Pittsburgh Legacy Project and Andy Lipkin will provide contact information for Sam Bernstien who was involved with the New Castle closure. Samie Winick noted that members were invited to take their family Yahrzeit plaques. Aaron Hively advised that Sarah Wilschak has been working with the Legacy Project.

The Education Sub-Committee had its first meeting last week. It is chaired by Nancy Burnett. Additional committee members are Brigitt Berk, Melissa Batemen and Bonnie Burdman. Members will be bringing to the Committee their suggestions for what a restructured education system might look like with or without MSJS. They will also be considering what the role a full time Cantor/Educator would have in the education system.

The 16 member Clergy Sub-Committee had its first meeting today with Tri-Chairs Mark Perlman, Jack Kessler and Nancy Burnett. They have already been in touch with the Central Conference of American Rabbis (CCAR) and have determined that the normal timeframe for searches for a Rabbi in the following year was to solicit applications between July and September and that interviews take place after the High Holidays and extend to the end of the year. You are required to use their hiring process. Because of this compressed timetable, it is essential that this Committee have its recommendation for consolidation by early June so that it can be approved by each Congregation shortly thereafter. The Clergy Subcommittee will also be reaching out to the American Conference of Cantors (ACC) which provides Cantorial candidates. Jack Kessler noted that the hope of the Sub-Committee is that the new Clergy will provide dynamic leadership that will inspire greater Temple membership and support.

**3. Finance/Building Sub-Committee Report:** Lee Burdman reported that his Sub-Committee held its second meeting on March 7, 2012 and is gathering a great deal of data. They have reviewed membership rolls of each Temple and compared their dues structures. They are currently not planning to develop a dues recommendation until they receive a staffing and clergy

recommendation. They are also waiting until the end of tax season to gain more guidance from H.D. Davis which handles the books for 2 of the 3 Temples.

Based on numbers they have assembled, we currently have 384 active in town family units with a range of additional Associate members at various levels, which will likely have only limited applicability to the new entity.

The Committee is still getting a handle on Endowments and Investments, but it appears that when the Cemetery funds are factored out, the consolidated Temple will have approximately \$6.4 million dollars and a decision will have to be made at some point on how much that might be drawn down.

Current dues break down as follows:

	Family	Single
El Emeth:	\$750.00/year	\$400.00
Rodef Sholom:	\$920.00 year	\$540.00
Ohev Tzedek	\$1,018.00/year	\$626.00

The above dues do not reflect additional voluntary dues which breaks down as follows:

El Emeth	\$55,000/year
Rodef Sholom	\$22,000/year
Ohev Tzedek	\$2,100/year

Major Fundraising also varies with Ohev Tzedek having the most successful event with Bruce Zoldan's Super Bowl Raffle, followed by El Emeth's Fiesta/Raffle and Rodef's Annual Raffle/Wine Test. Aaron Hively noted that the Brotherhood and Sisterhood at Rodef raise the lion share of funds currently.

Lee Burdman noted that with the consolidate congregation there may be less overlap and therefore less funds generated.

Lee Burdman reiterated that the Architect previously hired by the Collaboration Committee will be engaged later in the process.

**4. Contacts with Beth Israel Temple in Warren:** Mark Huberman reported that he has had no further contact from Attorney Curt Bogen or anyone else associated with the Warren Temple concerning their reported interest in participating in our consolidation process.

**5. Unaffiliated Jews:** Susan Epstein asked about the number of unaffiliated Jews in the area that might be targets for involvement in the new entity. Andy Lipkin reported that about 37% of Jewish family units are currently unaffiliated and that almost 40% of individuals are not affiliated. Mark Huberman reiterated Jack Kessler's hope that a new congregation with new dynamic leadership could positively impact those numbers.

**6. Consolidation Costs:** Mark Huberman noted that if our goal of consolidation is achieved by our June deadline then it will be necessary, as was the case with the Cemetery Association, to incur significant legal costs in creating the new entity, obtaining tax exempt status and consolidating endowments and other funds. Andy Lipkin noted that the Federation advanced the funds for the Cemetery Association subject to reimbursement by the Association once formed. Mark Huberman suggested that the Thomases Family Endowment might be an appropriate entity to which to submit an application for funding, which application is available on the Federation website. The upcoming deadlines for applications are May 15 and September 15. Mark, Elliot and Lee agreed to discuss the process.

**7. Jewish Journal:** Mark Huberman agreed to submit the next report to the Jewish Journal

**8. Next Meeting:** The next meeting of the Committee is set for April 13, 2021 at 7:00 p.m. via zoom.

**9. Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 8:10 p.m.